

**EMERGING SYSTEMS FOR  
MANAGING WORKPLACE CONFLICT:  
LESSONS FROM AMERICAN CORPORATIONS  
FOR MANAGERS AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION PROFESSIONALS**

**By David B. Lipsky, Ronald L. Seeber, and Richard D. Fincher  
San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2003**

Table of Contents

***Part One: The Evolution of Conflict Management Systems***

**CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION: THE EMERGENCE OF CONFLICT  
MANAGEMENT**

Inclination to Change

Dissatisfaction with Conventional Approaches to Dispute Resolution  
Litigation, Dispute, and Conflict Management  
Conflict Management Systems

The Concept of a Conflict Management System

Why Study Conflict Management in the Workplace?

Our Methodology and Data

The Design and Outline of the Book

**CHAPTER 2. FORCES OF CHANGE: THE TRANSFORMATION OF  
THE SOCIAL CONTRACT IN THE WORKPLACE**

The Evolution of Social Contract Theory

The Traditional Social Contract at the Workplace

Industrialization and the Web of Rules  
Scientific Management and the Standardization of Employment Practices

Management Authority

The “New Deal” Social Contract

The Rise of Unionism

Characteristics of the New Deal Social Contract

Labor-Management Relations Under the New Deal Social Contract

Amending the Social Contract: Truman’s White House  
Conference, 1945

Other Features of the New Deal Social Contract

Dispute Resolution and Labor-Management Relations

Forces of Change

The Turbulent 1960s and the Strengthening of Individual Rights

Globalization and the Restructuring of the American Economy

A Shift in the Political Climate and the Deregulation of Industry

The Litigation Society

Documenting the Explosion

Legal and Tort Reform

The Professionalization of Human Resource Management

The Decline of Unionism

Management Opposition to Unions

The Weakness of American Labor Law

The Reorganization of the Workplace

High-Performance Work Systems

Employee Participation

Conclusion

**CHAPTER 3. THE RISE OF ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

The Pros and Cons of ADR

The Advantages of ADR

The Disadvantages of ADR

Patterns of ADR Use

A Survey of the Fortune 1000

- Experience with Forms of ADR
- Frequency of ADR Use
- Contingent Use of ADR
- ADR Use by Type of Dispute
- ADR Use by Industry
- Corporate Conflict Resolution Policy by Industry

#### Why Do Corporations Use ADR?

- Triggers for ADR
- Economic Reasons for Using ADR

#### Why Some Corporations Do Not Use ADR

- Aspects of ADR Processes Companies Find Disadvantageous
- Concerns About Neutrals' Qualifications

#### Conclusion

### **CHAPTER 4. NEW STRATEGIES OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT: THE EMERGENCE OF A NEW PARADIGM**

#### An Analytical Model of the Choice of Conflict Management Strategy

- Three Strategies of Conflict Management
- The Disposition of Decision Makers
  - Zero-Sum Strategies
  - Variable-Sum Strategies
  - Mixed-Motive Decision Making
  - Alignment Between Conviction and Strategy
- The Operation of the Model
- Some Correlates of the Choice of Strategy
  - Size
  - Industry Concentration
  - Industry

#### Environmental Factors

- Market Competition
- Government Regulation
- Litigation Trend and Tort Reform
- Statutory Requirements and Court Mandates
- Unionization

### Organizational Motivations

- Organizational Culture
- Management Commitment
- The Role of the Champion
- Exposure Profile
- The Precipitating Event

### The Organization's Choice: Some Examples

- Contend Strategy
- Settle Strategy
- Prevent Strategy

### Conclusion

## ***Part Two: The Establishment of Conflict Management Systems***

### **CHAPTER 5. DESIGN OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS: INTERNAL FEATURES**

#### Scope of Workplace Issues

#### Eligibility to Use the Workplace System

#### System Stakeholders

#### Union Participation

#### Elements of a Fair System

- Voluntariness
- Protection of Privacy and Confidentiality
- Impartiality of Neutrals
- Trained and Qualified Neutrals
- Prohibition of Retaliation
- Protection of Collective Bargaining Rights
- Diversity and Accessibility
- Preclusion of Statutory Rights

### Other Factors Influencing System Design

- Anticipating Resistance to the System
- Right of Employees to Select Access Options
- Who Pays for the Use of the Internal System Features?
- Criteria to Evaluate Options Within the System

### Common Design Features

- The Open Door
- Ombudspersons
- Hot Lines
- Managerial Mediation
- Resolution Facilitators
- Conferences with an Employee to Discuss Options
- Internal Peer Mediation
- Trained Employee Advisers
- Peer Review and Employee Appeals
- Executive Panels

### Conclusion

## **CHAPTER 6. DESIGN OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS: EXTERNAL FEATURES**

### External Design Options with Workplace Systems

- External Mediation
- Advisory (Nonbinding) Arbitration or Hearings
- Fact Finding with a Recommendation
- Final and Binding Arbitration
- Concerns About Arbitration
- Legal Consultation Benefits
- Employee Costs for Mediation and Arbitration by External Neutrals
- Employee Costs to Initiate Mediation or Arbitration
- Cost Sharing in Fees of the Mediator or Arbitrator

### The Legal Environment for Mandatory Arbitration

### Recent Evolution of Case Law on Employment Arbitration

- The Gilmer Case: Extending the Reach of Arbitration
- The Circuit City Case: Upholding Arbitration Agreements Under the

Federal Arbitration Act  
The Waffle House Case: Allowing Independent Prosecution by the EEOC  
The Minority Duffield Case Is Reversed

### Stakeholder Views of Mandatory Employment Arbitration

View from the Plaintiff Bar  
View of the EEOC  
View of the National Academy of Arbitrators  
The Dunlop Commission on Worker-Management Relations  
The Due Process Protocol on Employment Arbitration

### Legal Challenges to Mandatory Pre-dispute Arbitration

Challenges Based on Contract Defenses  
Adequate Consideration  
    Validity of Adhesion Contracts  
    Validity of Ambiguous Language  
    Knowing and Voluntary Agreement to Arbitrate  
Challenges Based on Unconscionability  
    Costs to Employee  
    Restrictions on Discovery  
    Restrictions on Scope of Remedy  
    Employer Control of the List of Arbitrators  
    Form of the Award

### Best Practices in Design of Employment Arbitration Provisions

Scope of Disputes Subject to Arbitration  
Exclusivity  
Requirement to Attempt Mediation Prior to Filing a Demand  
Time Limit to Initiate Arbitration  
Right to Representation  
Initiation of Arbitration  
Selection of Authority of the Arbitrator  
Venue and Governing Law  
Prehearing Discovery  
Subpoenas and Documents  
Order of Presentation  
Standard and Burden of Persuasion  
Evidence and Argument  
Allocation of Arbitration Expenses  
Form of the Award

Record of Proceeding  
Damages and Relief  
The Uncertainty of Predispute Mandatory Arbitration

Workplace Neutrals: Qualifications and Standards

The Employment Mediation Profession  
The Employment Arbitration Profession  
Ethical Expectations and Qualifications in Mandatory Employment  
Arbitration  
Sources of Workplace Neutrals

Conclusion

**CHAPTER 7. IMPLEMENTATION OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS**

Phase One: Assessment, Inquiry, and Initial Commitment

Embrace the Impetus for Change  
Define the Business Case  
Align with an Internal Champion  
Obtain Senior Leadership Commitment  
Outline a Design Contract  
Select and Build the Design Team  
Determine Whether to Retain an External Design Consultant  
Create a Work Plan  
Diagnose Current Organizational Conflict  
Decide Whether to Move Ahead with the Project

Phase Two: Research, Analysis, and Internal Alignment

Conduct Research on Employee Dispute Systems  
Benchmark Other Organizations and Define Best Practices  
Design the Data and Metrics  
Conduct Employee and Management Focus Groups  
Respond to Myths of Workplace Systems

Phase Three: System Design and Support

Draft the System  
Calibrate the Proposed Design  
Build the Support Structure

Consider a Pilot Project Prior to Full Implementation  
Present the Plan to Senior Leadership for Final Approval

#### Phase Four: Finalizing the Design

Complete the System Design  
Encourage Adversaries to Embrace the New Workplace System  
Determine Whether to Include a Mandatory Arbitration Option  
Draft the Summary Plan Description

#### Phase Five: Implementation and Training

Launch and Market the System  
Clarify the Role and Responsibilities of All Players in the System  
Train Supervisors to Support the System

#### Phase Six: Institutionalization

Build Incentives to Use the Workplace System  
Maintain Credibility Through Ongoing Education and Reinforcing  
Communications  
Conduct an Ongoing Assessment of Outcomes  
Readjust the Workplace System over Time

#### Conclusion

## **CHAPTER 8. EVALUATION OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS**

### System Evaluation by Organizations

Key Elements of Evaluation Success  
Who Evaluates the Conflict Management System?  
A Work Agenda for Evaluation  
An Example: Evaluation at Shell Oil

### The Metrics of Conflict Management Evaluation

The Frame of Reference: General Methodological Problems  
Expectations, Hypotheses, and Results  
    Expectations About Conflict Management Systems  
    Hypothesized Direct Efficiency Effects  
    Hypothesized Effectiveness Effects  
    Hypothesized Indirect Effects



Evaluation of Conflict Management Systems: Five Case Examples

Workers' Compensation and Conflict Management

Evaluation of the Massachusetts Commission Against Discrimination

Alternative Dispute Resolution Program

Evaluation of the U.S. Department of Labor Pilot Program for Enforcement Cases

Measurement and Evaluation of REDRESS at the U.S. Postal Service

An Evaluation of the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

Mediation Program

Conclusion

***Part 3: The Future of Conflict Management Systems***

**CHAPTER 9. BARRIERS TO THE GROWTH OF CONFLICT MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS**

The Logic of Conflict Management

Stakeholder Motivations and Objectives

Employees

Unions

Public Agencies

Neutrals and Their Organizations

Leadership and the Uncertainties About the Effects of Conflict Management

Does Experimentation Become Institutionalized?

Conclusion

**CHAPTER 10. THE FUTURE OF WORKPLACE DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

Anticipated Changes to the Acceptance and Role of Workplace Systems

Broadening Acceptance

Will Workplace Systems Go Global?

Workplace Systems Will Become Institutionalized

Integration of Systems with Other Corporate Values

Alignment of Systems with Other Workplace Processes and Initiatives  
Alignment with Human Resource Processes  
Alignment with Quality Initiatives  
Alignment as a Learning Organization  
Alignment with Team Concepts  
Flatter and More Agile Organizations  
Marketing a System as a Competitive Benefit  
New Frontiers of Workplace Dispute Resolution

On the Other Hand

Legal Problems Could Slow Conflict Management Growth  
Representation of Plaintiffs  
Predispute Waivers  
Potential for Taking Advantage  
Problems with Neutrals  
Providers of Neutrals Will Evolve  
The Unlawful Practice of Law  
ADR Providers Will Be More Closely Scrutinized

Conflict Management and the Tipping Point

***APPENDIX A. A LIST OF CORPORATIONS AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS STUDIED BY THE AUTHORS AND REFERRED TO IN THIS BOOK***

***APPENDIX B. GLOSSARY OF TERMS***